

Oct. 03, 2009

Honorable Jose A.R. Melo Chairman **Commission on Elections (Comelec)** Intramuros, Manila

and

Commissioners **Comelec En Banc**

Dear Chairman Melo,

The undersigned below – concerned citizens and organizations from various sectors and professions – are closely watching the preparations and other developments in connection with the May 2010 automated election.

In the spirit of transparency and in line with our common concern to safeguard voters' rights and for the success of the coming election, we would like to express our deep concern with regard to the source code review.s

May our following joint statement merit your attention and response.

Hoping for your good health.

(Sgd) BISHOP BRODERICK S. PABILLO, DD Chairman, National Secretariat for Social Action Catholic Bishops Conference of the Phils (NASSA-CBCP)

(Sgd) SR. MARY JOHN MANANZAN Co-Chairperson, Association of Major Religious in the Philippines (AMRSP)

(Sgd) DR. PABLO MANALASTAS IT Faculty, Ateneo de Manila University; University of the Philippines; Senior Fellow, CenPEG

(Sgd) FR. JOE DIZON Promoter, Solidarity Philippines (Sgd) ALFREDO E. PASCUAL

President, University of the **Philippines Alumni Association** (UPAA)

(Sgd) REV. REX RB REYES, JR. General Secretary, National Council of Churches in the Philippines (NCCP)

(Sgd) BISHOP DEOGRACIAS INIGUEZ Chairman, Committee on Public Affairs Catholic Bishops Conference of the Phils (CBCP) & Ecumenical Bishops Forum

(Sqd) DR. MA. REGINA E. ESTUAR Chairperson, Department of Information Systems & Computer Science (DISCS) Ateneo de Manila University

AND OTHER SIGNATORIES AT THE BOTTOM OF THE STATEMENT

P.S. For purposes of this joint appeal, please send your response to:

(Sgd) BISHOP BRODERICK S. PABILLO, DD

Chairman, National Secretariat for Social Action-Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines (NASSA-CBCP)

Tel: 527-4163 / 527-4147/ 527-4134; Fax: 527-4144

CC: CenPEG TelFax 9299526



A FOLLOW-UP APPEAL TO THE COMELEC COMPLY WITH THE AUTOMATED ELECTION SYSTEM LAW; RELEASE THE SOURCE CODE FOR REVIEW NOW!

October 03, 2009

The country has barely eight months to go before May 10, 2010 when 48 million Filipino voters are expected to troop to the polls. On that day, the voters shade their votes on small ovals opposite the names of their candidates on ballots 2.5 feet long, and feed the ballots into the Precinct Count Optical Scan-Optical Mark Reader (PCOS-OMR) machines that will read and count their votes, and transmit the vote tallies at the end of voting day to the Consolidation and Canvassing System (CCS) machines. If everything goes as planned, the next President, Vice President, and other national and local elective officials will be known in 2-3 days.

For the speed that it promises, the Automated Election System (AES) is certainly revolutionary, and the AES Law or RA 9369, a landmark piece of legislation that could modernize the fraud-ridden voting in the Philippines. But speed without addressing the deep-seated problem of cheating in the country will make the automated election a wasteful exercise at PhP7.2 billion. Machines can help, but will not solve fraud completely.

The voters must be assured that the machines themselves cannot be used as instruments for cheating, that they have been programmed correctly and are internally resistant to vote rigging. For this, the RA 9369 provides for certain safeguards that the Comelec is duty bound to implement. One of the key safeguards is the source code review provision:

Section 12 [Sec 14] of RA 9369 mandates, "<u>Once an AES technology is</u> <u>selected for implementation</u>, the Commission shall <u>promptly</u> make the source code of that technology <u>available and open</u> to any interested political party or groups <u>which may conduct their own review thereof</u>." [underscoring supplied]

Source code is the human-readable set of computer program instructions used to specify the internal actions to be performed by the PCOS-OMR called SAES-1800 (Smartmatic Auditable Election System) machines and CCS called REIS (Real-Time Information System) computers. A most thorough examination of the source code for correctness and security of the programs running in the e-voting machines to be used for the first time in the country's election history must be undertaken by reputable computer scientists who are known for their independence and probity and are unattached to the vendor or the Comelec. This will ascertain that the programs in the machines will correctly implement the provisions of RA 9369 for counting,-canvassing, and transmission of the votes and that any serious security flaws are identified and properly fixed. More than the external procedural features of the machines – that is, feeding of the ballots into the PCOS-OMR machines to printing of the Election Returns – the correctness and the security of the internal programs running in the machines should be of primordial concern.

It was in this spirit of transparency that on May 26, 2009, the Center for People Empowerment in Governance (CenPEG) wrote the Comelec requesting for the source code of the counting and canvassing computers as well as the election database and servers. On June 10, the Comelec en banc approved the release of the source code for review through its Minute Resolution No. 09-0366



but it was delivered to CenPEG only on July 10, the day of the contract signing between the Comelec and Smartmatic-TIM.

To this day, however, the Comelec has not yet released the source code, citing as reasons the following: "lack of guidelines" (Comelec spokesperson James Jimenez), "premature release" (Comelec Executive Director Jose Tolentino, also PMO), "CenPEG (and other groups) to apply (first) as resource person ... and under controlled conditions," and "the source code does not currently exist" (Atty. Ferdinand Rafanan of the Comelec legal department), and "we are still waiting for Smartmatic-TIM to turn over the source code so that it could be opened for review" (Commissioner Rene Sarmiento who pointed out that the source code is not owned by Smartmatic but by another firm, Canada's Dominion Voting Systems!).

Then on the September 21 poll automation forum on ANC TV, Atty. Rafanan delivered a final blow to the call for source code review by announcing that "CenPEG (and other interested groups) will not do a source code review, but that an international certification agency will do it as a requisite to TEC (Technical Evaluation Committee) certification." This announcement is misleading. As clearly spelled out in RA 9369, the certification by TEC through an international entity is a separate requirement (Sec. 9) from the mandate to release the source code for review by interested groups (Sec. 12).

We, concerned citizens and organizations from various professions and sectors, join other interested groups like CenPEG in demanding that the source code be made available to interested groups as provided by law so that it may be reviewed by competent computer experts who are not vendors or Comelecdesignated but are independent and known for their probity and integrity in the IT hardware and software security industry.

Source code review, in accordance with international standards, takes time. Any further delay in the release of the source code for thorough examination by "interested groups" will surely frustrate the intent of the law to give all concerned the opportunity to review the source code and be assured of the integrity of the e-voting system.

We believe that implementing this particular safeguard, even if not a surecure to fraud, is a big step toward ensuring the integrity of the automated election system, that internal safeguards are well plugged in while assuring the Filipino voters that the machines are secured, accurate, and reliable. Reviewing the source code will certainly not make the system impervious to external attacks and manipulation but rather make it more immune to manipulation as possible vulnerabilities are identified and fixed beforehand. In landmark cases in the U.S., more and more citizens' groups are calling for e-voting systems to be periodically reviewed long before the elections to check if they are defective, obsolete, or otherwise unacceptable.

We reiterate in strongest terms our call for the Comelec to comply with Sec. 12 of RA 9369 and release the source code of the PCOS-OMR and CCS computer programs NOW before it is too late.

As we sign this joint statement, of primordial concern to us are the rights of the voters and the integrity of the voting system. While our demand for the release of the source code is based on law, we believe that the review is critical on moral, political and economic grounds. Let us work together in making sure that the integrity of the machines and our votes will not be under grave threats.



Signed:

(Sgd) **ALFREDO E. PASCUAL** President, University of the Philippines Alumni Association (UPAA)

(Sgd) **BILL LUZ** Chairman, Movement for Good Governance (MGG)

(Sgd) CONRADO M. DAYRIT III

ICT Educator & Entrepreneur President, STI (San Fernando, Angeles and Guagua)

(Sgd) **JUDGE DOLORES ESPANOL** Chair, Transparency International-Philippines

(Sgd) **SERGE OSMENA** Former Senator

(Sgd) MA. REGINA E. ESTUAR, PhD

Chair, Department of Information Systems & Computer Science, Ateneo de Manila Univ

(Sgd) BISHOP DEOGRACIAS INIGUEZ

Chair, Committee on Public Affairs, CBCP Diocese of Kaloocan

(Sgd) DR. JAIME DL CARO

Chair, Dept. of Computer Science, College of Engineering University of the Philippines, Diliman

(Sgd) SHERWIN ONA

IT Department College of Computer Studies De La Salle University, Manila

(Sgd) ROMMEL P. FERIA

Faculty, Dept. of Computer Science College of Engineering (Sgd) **BISHOP BRODERICK S. PABILLO** Chairman, National Secretariat for Social Action – Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines (NASSA-CBCP)

(Sgd) **SERGIO J. MONTINOLA** Concerned Citizens of the Catholic Church Ateneo de Manila University '50

(Sgd) **REV. REX RB REYES, JR.** General Secretary, National Council of Churches in the Philippines (NCCP)

(Sgd) **SR. MARY JOHN MANANZAN, OSB** National Co-Chairperson, Association of Major Religious Superiors of the Philippines (AMRSP)

(Sgd) **AQUILINO PIMENTEL III** Secretary General, PDP-LABAN

(Sgd) **PROF. FATIMA CASTILLO** Former Dean, College of Arts & Sciences, University of the Philippines, Manila

(Sgd) **REP. RAYMOND PALATINO** Kabataan Party-List House of Representatives

(Sgd) BISHOP FELIXBERTO L. CALANG, IFI

Ecumenical Bishops Forum (EBF); and Diocese of Mobuca, Cagayan de Oro City

(Sgd) ANTONIO L. TINIO

National Chair, Alliance of Concerned Teachers (ACT) of the Philippines

(Sgd) **RODOLFO 'JUN' LOZADA** Whistle Blower ZTE-NBN Deal IT Engineer



(Sgd) ATTY. EDWIN DELA CRUZ President International Seafarers Action Center (ISAC)

(Sgd) MAE PANER ("Juana Change") **Artists Revolution**

(Sgd) ALVIN PETERS President, National Union of Students of the Philippines

(Sgd) PABLO MANALASTAS, PhD Faculty, IT Department, Ateneo de Manila University and UP

(Sgd) REP. NERI COLMENARES House of Representatives

(Sgd) ROSALINDA CRESCINI-TABLANG Executive Director Council for People's Development and Governance (CPDG)

(Sgd) AUGUSTO LAGMAN TransparentElections.org

(Sgd) BIENVENIDO LUMBERA, PhD National Artist and Ramon Magsaysay Awardee

(Sgd) WILMARC D. LOPEZ IT Department, College of Computer Studies De La Salle University

(Sgd) JOHN PETER LOH Developer Proximity Philippines / BBDO Guerrero

(Sgd) DR. CAROL PAGADUAN-ARAULLO Chair, Bagong Alyansang Makabayan

(Sgd) ANGELITO S. AVERIA, JR. President, Philippine Computer

(Sgd) FR. JOE DIZON Promoter, Solidarity Philippines

(Sgd) FR. HERBERT FADREQUILA, JR. Executive Director, IFI Visayas-Mindanao Regional Office for Development; with 2 others

(Sgd) ANTHONY IAN "TONYO" CRUZ President, TXTPower

(Sgd) ENGELS ANTONIO Chairman, Bluepoint Foundation

(Sgd) DR. REY LESACA, JR. Chairman, Bayan Muna Party List

(Sgd) BISHOP RUDY N. JULIADA, IFI Diocese of Libertad, Misamis Oriental

(Sgd) JUDY M. TAGUIWALO, PhD Co-Chairperson, Pagbabago! People's Movement for Change

(Sgd) FELIX MUGA II, PhD Faculty, Ateneo de Manila University

(Sgd) FEDERICO VICENTE C. SEVILLA III CEO, FS3 Consulting, Inc.

(Sgd) VINCENT GULINAO Solutions Engineer Innovations Team, Colibria Philippines

(Sgd) RENATO CONSTANTINO, JR.

(Sgd) PROF. HARRY S. ROQUE UP College of Law &



Emergency Response Team (PhCERT)

(Sgd) **LUZON U. LILAMIS** Architect; Vice Chair, Mindanao Laymen's Organization

(SGD) BP. ELIEZER M. PASCUA General Secretary United Church of Christ in the Philippines (UCCP)

(SGD) FR. VIC ARELLANO Rector, Lapasan Parish, Cagayan de Oro

(SGD) FR. JUNE MARK YANEZ Rector, City Parish, Cagayan de Oro City

(SGD) FR. ANTONIO ABLON Rector, Bulua Parish, Cagayan de Oro City

(Sgd) **Fr. Mario Ellarina** Rector, Agusan Parish, Tagoloan, Misamis Oriental.

(SGD) FR. PATRICK MABALACAD Rector, Sta.Ana Parish, Tagoloan, Misamis Oriental

(SGD) FR. CHRISTOPHER ABLON Rector, Malaybalay City Parish

(SGD) REV. AMMA CATUBIG Rector, Iponan Parish, Cagayan de Oro City

(SGD) RONA V. YANEZ Administrative Secretary, Mobuca Diocese, CDO

(SGD) ROLAND CRUZ Youth and Student Ministry, CDO

(SGD) JAY-ARE BACABIS Technical Staff, Diocese, CDO Concerned Citizens Movement (CCM)

(SGD) SIMEON V. MARCELO President Philippine Bar Association

(Sgd) **FR. CARMELO O. DIOLA** National Coordinator, Dilaab Foundation, Inc. HEARTS & *Pwede Pala Movement*

(SGD) SR. ANA MARIA RACA Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. RAMIRA UY Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. CECILLE Order of Saint Benedict (OSB)

(SGD) SR. VICTORIA BULACAN Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. SOLEDAD HILATO Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. PATR ICIA ALCAREZ Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. AGNELLA CAPILI Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) S.M. ANGELINE ARCEO, OSB St. Scholastica's College, Mla

(SGD) S.M. ROSELITA GERONIMO, OSB St. Scholastica"s College, Mla

(SGD) S.M. PACITA AGDAN Order of Saint Benedict



Appendices

(SGD) ALDEEM A. YANEZ Secretariat, Bishop's Office, Diocese, CDO

(SGD) FR. JAMES ATILLO, JR., IFI Rector, Manticao Parish, Misamis Oriental

(SGD) FR. FRANKLIN TELEN, JR. Rector, IFI Naawan Parish, Misamis Oriental

(SGD) FR. ROLANDO ABEJO Rector, Libertad Parish, Misamis Oriental

(SGD) FR. JAMES B. MISO Rector, Alubijid Parish, Misamis Oriental

(SGD) FR. ENRIETO BILLONES Rector, Molugan Parish, Misamis Oriental

(Sqd) Fr. Rex Tandog Rector, Paypay Parish, Daan Bantayan, Cebu

(SGD) RICK BAHAGUE Coordinator **Computer Professionals' Union**

(SGD) EMMI DE JESUS Secretary General GABRIELA

(SGD) EDELBERTO GUYANO Program Officer **CBCP-NASSA**

(SGD) HONEY P. BESO Program Coordinator **CBCP-NASSA**

(SGD) MARK FORONDA Program Officer **CBCP-NASSA**

(SGD) JOYCE PALACOD **Program Coordinator CBCP-NASSA**

(SGD) SR. MARY SAMUELLE FORMOSO Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. VIRGINIA FERINO Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) SR. WALDETRUDIS G. MAGACAT Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) REV. NOEL GANAPIN Rector, Lourdes Parish, Alubijid, Misamis Or.

(SGD) FR. REDEEMER YAECTOR **Opol Parish, Misamis Oriental**

(SGD) ANALIE V. TANDOG Administrative Office, IFI Visatas-Mindanao **Regional Office for Development**

(SGD) SR. LUMEN DUNGCA Order of Saint Benedict

(SGD) JOSE ENRIQUE AFRICA **Research Head** IBON

(SGD) MARICOR AKOL Transparentelections.org

(SGD) CARLITO NONEIL SANTOS **Country Program Head** CBCP-NASSA

(SGD) MARIE CHRISTINE A. PEREZ Program Officer CBCP-NASSA

(SGD) JOSEPHINE IGNACIO Program Coordinator CBCP-NASSA

(SGD) ALMA CALDERON Program Officer **CBCP-NASSA**



(SGD) JOAN GREGORIO Accounting Assistant CBCP-NASSA

(SGD) MIKE BARTOLOME **Program Officer** CBCP-NASSA

(Sgd) Rolando Arriola Cashier CBCP-ECPPC

(SGD) JOHN NELSON TAN CBCP-ECPPC

(SGD) MELY R. MARAAR Administration Assistant CBCP-ECMI

(SGD) NORMAN CORAL RISE

(SGD) PROF. ALBERTO MEDALLA Faculty Department of Information Systems and Computer Science (DISCS) Ateneo de Manila University (ADMU)

(SGD) PROF. JESSICA SUGAY Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. HUBERT URSUA Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. MA. MERCEDES M. RODRIGO Associate Professor **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. PELO AGCORO Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) CHRISTIAN JAY GABRIELLES Accountant **CBCP-NASSA**

(SGD) DOLLY PANGILINAN President SPDR Inc./ Volunteer

(SGD) ANGELITO CARIASO Accountant CBCP-ECPPC

(SGD) TOM ABUASO Program Coordinator **CBCP-ECIP-NS**

(SGD) MA. EDIZA PUMARADA **Program Coordinator** CBCP-ECMI

(SGD) AMY PANALIGAN RISE

(SGD) PROF. MARLENE DE LEON Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. SANDRA LUVENIA Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. DAVID DIY Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. CLARENCE BORROMEO Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**

(SGD) PROF. JOSE ALFREDO DE VERA III Faculty **DISCS-ADMU**



(SGD) PROF. ANDREI CORONEL

Faculty DISCS- ADMU

(SGD) SR. COUNSUELO FARELA

Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. AURORA DALAY

Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. MA. UNIA GEAGA Member

Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) MARIE JOY S. ANDAYA Employee

Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) JANNELE CANDANA

Employee Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. EMMA VIJANDRE

Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. ALAINE PEDRO

Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) JAIME OGOC

Employee Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. JOSEPHINE T. YBALLE, ICM Member

(SGD) PROF. A MAGCUYON Faculty DISCS- ADMU

(SGD) SR. ANGELITA NAVARO

Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. ROSISA MENDOZA Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) VIOLETA IBUAN Employee

Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) LINDA CAMBUYA Employee Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. JOSEFINA C. DIAZ Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. PERPETICA BERNARDO Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. REMEDIOS ENCARNACION Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) RONALDO LIBRANDO

Employee Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. SALVE UNDAL, ICM Member



Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. MANUELA MARTINEZ, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. CONSUELO K. ARANDE, ICM Member

Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. SONIA OSMENA, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. MARIA ALABANZA, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. JOSEPLHINE ONG, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. EMMA G. DE GUZMAN, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. HELEN RIVERA, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) MARK ANTHONY GARCIA Staff CTHOR

(SGD) MARINEL OPINALDO Staff CTHOR

(SGD) MARIA TERESA BAYLE Principal, High School Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. MA. DELIA CABRAL, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. LACZAMANA, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. PAULINA CUEVAS, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. ROSE MARIE INIGO, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. NELLIA ZARRAGA, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. ELIZA F. CABANLING, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) SR. TERESITA MONTAGO, ICM Member Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary

(SGD) LUKE COXA Staff CTHOR

(SGD) WILLIAM CAPILI Staff CTHOR

(SGD) CHRISE DELA PENA Coordinator



St. Therese College, QC (STC-QC)

(SGD) TERESITA VALENCIA Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) LEA M. MARTINEZ Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) GLENDA CORDERO Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) AIDA ANGROS Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) MAR. CRISTINA OBILLI Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) PATRICIA BILLONES Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) JUDITH CALDERON Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) DIVINE BALUBAR Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) MAILYN SOLIMAN Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) ROMINA ENORIA Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) ANDY NOIL Faculty Member STC-QC STC-QC

(SGD) RAUL BERNARDO Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) GEMMA DULTIN Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) MEL MAGAWAY Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) CHRISTINE JAYNE BERNARDO Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) FRANCISCA B. DELA CRUZ Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) DORS JOSE Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) AUDREY GINEZA Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) ANGELICA TILOS Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) IRENE LLUISMA Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) CYRUS VALENCIA Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) EDGAR TABIOS Faculty Member STC-QC



(SGD) DELIA SAN ANDRES Faculty Member STC-QC

(SGD) REV. NOEL BAYBAY Program Officer for Clergy

UCCP

(SGD) N. ORANA Staff UCCP

(SGD) YONEL LIBAN Staff UCCP

(SGD) ARMANDO OPINA JR. Staff UCCP

(SGD) Bien Tutur CBCP-NASSA **(SGD) GLORIA GUZMAN** Office of the General Secretary UCCP

(SGD) REV. RUEL GARCIA HRD Head UCCP

(SGD) JOPHET DOMINGO Staff UCCP

(SGD) DEBORAH GAROL Staff UCCP

(SGD) R. BAUTISTA Staff UCCP